

A Logical Foundation For Potentialist Set Theory

Sharon Berry

January 3, 2020

Contents

| | |
|---|-----------|
| I | 11 |
| 1 Introduction | 13 |
| 1.1 Mathematics as a Touchstone and the Centrality of Set Theory | 14 |
| 1.2 Actualism and its Discontents | 16 |
| 1.3 A New Flavor of Potentialism | 18 |
| 1.4 Outline | 20 |
| 1.5 Relation To Mathematical and Philosophical Practice | 23 |
| 2 Actualist Set Theory and Problems for it | 27 |
| 2.1 Actualist Set Theory and The Iterative Hierarchy Conception | 27 |
| 2.2 A Burali-Forti/Arbitrariness Problem | 29 |
| 2.3 Categoricity and Quasicategoricity Arguments | 32 |
| 2.3.1 McGee and Appeal to Ur-elements | 32 |
| 2.3.2 Martin | 37 |
| 2.4 A Problem Justifying Replacement | 40 |
| 2.5 Indefinite Extensibility | 49 |
| 2.5.1 Height Potentialism And No More | 49 |
| 2.5.2 Contrast with Dummett | 51 |
| 3 Putnamian Potentialism: Putnam and Hellman | 55 |
| 3.1 Putnam | 57 |
| 3.2 Hellman | 61 |
| 3.2.1 Difficulties With Hellman | 64 |
| 4 Previous Approaches: Parsons and Linnebo | 69 |
| 4.1 Linnebo | 69 |
| 4.2 Cashing out Parsonian Set Theoretic Modality | 73 |
| 4.2.1 The Constructivist Option | 73 |
| 4.2.2 The Interpretational Option | 78 |

| | | |
|-----------|--|------------|
| 5 | Anti-Objectivism About Set Theory | 85 |
| 5.1 | Strong vs. Weak Anti-Objectivism | 86 |
| 5.2 | Problems for Strong Anti-Objectivism | 89 |
| | 5.2.1 Objections to Field's Weak Anti-Objectivism | 90 |
| 5.3 | Feferman | 94 |
| 5.4 | Hamkins' Multiverse | 98 |
| | 5.4.1 Forcing Fundamentals | 98 |
| | 5.4.2 Hamkin's Proposal | 101 |
| | 5.4.3 Motivations for the Multiverse and Responses | 103 |
| | | |
| II | | 109 |
| | | |
| 6 | The Language of Logical Possibility | 111 |
| 6.1 | Agenda | 111 |
| 6.2 | Logical Possibility Simpliciter | 113 |
| 6.3 | Contrast With Other Modal Notions | 115 |
| 6.4 | Conditional Logical Possibility | 116 |
| 6.5 | A Sample of this Language's Power | 123 |
| | | |
| 7 | Purified Potentialist Set Theory: An Informal Sketch | 125 |
| 7.1 | Which Hierarchies? | 126 |
| 7.2 | A Putnamian Approach to Initial Segments | 127 |
| 7.3 | Characterizing Iterative Hierarchies Modally | 129 |
| | 7.3.1 Describing the Levels | 129 |
| | 7.3.2 Describing the Sets | 130 |
| 7.4 | Assignment Relations and Avoiding Quantifying In | 132 |
| | 7.4.1 Two roles for quantifying in | 132 |
| | 7.4.2 Preserving the Structure of Initial Segments | 133 |
| 7.5 | Big Picture | 135 |
| | | |
| 8 | Logico-Structural Potentialism | 137 |
| 8.1 | Functional Notation | 138 |
| 8.2 | Describing Standard-Width Initial Segments | 138 |
| 8.3 | Extendability | 141 |
| 8.4 | Eliminating quantifying in | 143 |
| 8.5 | The final product | 144 |
| | 8.5.1 Recursive Definition of Potentialist Paraphrases | 145 |
| | 8.5.2 Atomic Predicate Use Reducing Trick | 147 |
| | 8.5.3 Equivalence of Approaches | 147 |

| | | |
|------------|--|------------|
| 9 | How This Helps | 149 |
| 9.1 | Previously Mentioned Advantages | 149 |
| 9.1.1 | Avoiding Set Existence Awkwardness | 149 |
| 9.1.2 | Clarifying the Modal Notion at Issue | 152 |
| 9.2 | Metaphysical Non-Specialness | 154 |
| 9.3 | Avoiding Second Order Logic | 155 |
| 9.3.1 | Nominalistic Qualms | 155 |
| 9.3.2 | Conceptual Simplification | 156 |
| 9.4 | Quantifying-In | 159 |
| 9.4.1 | Sidestepping Controversy | 159 |
| 9.4.2 | Shyness and Compossibility Worries | 162 |
| 9.4.3 | Barcan Marcus | 163 |
| 10 | Naturalist Worries | 167 |
| 10.1 | Burgess and Rosen | 168 |
| 10.2 | Naturalism Rejecting Response | 170 |
| 10.3 | Naturalistic Response | 171 |
| III | | 175 |
| 11 | Content Restriction | 177 |
| 11.1 | A motivating example | 177 |
| 11.2 | Generalizing this idea | 180 |
| 11.3 | Formal Definition | 183 |
| 11.4 | Content Restriction for Potentialist Paraphrases | 188 |
| 12 | The Formal System I: Basic Rules | 189 |
| 12.1 | Rules Inherited from First Order Logic | 189 |
| 12.2 | \diamond Introduction and Elimination | 192 |
| 12.3 | \diamond Ignoring | 193 |
| 12.4 | Simple Comprehension | 194 |
| 12.5 | Relabing | 195 |
| 12.6 | Importing | 197 |
| 12.7 | Logical Closure | 197 |
| 13 | Notation and Some Example Arguments | 199 |
| 13.1 | \diamond Reducing and \square Expansion | 200 |
| 13.2 | Inner Diamond | 201 |
| 13.3 | Natural Deduction With Inner Diamond Arguments | 203 |

| | | |
|-----------|---|------------|
| 13.4 | Box Inference Rules | 210 |
| 13.5 | Lemmas about Well-Orderings | 212 |
| 13.5.1 | Lemma A | 213 |
| 13.5.2 | Lemma B | 217 |
| 13.6 | Pasting and Collapsing | 220 |
| 14 | The Formal System II | 227 |
| 14.1 | Cutback | 227 |
| 14.2 | Modal Comprehension | 228 |
| 14.3 | Possible Infinity | 230 |
| 14.4 | Possible Powerset | 231 |
| 14.5 | Choice | 233 |
| 14.6 | Possible Amalgamation | 234 |
| 15 | Vindication of FOL Inference in Set Theory | 239 |
| 15.1 | Proof Strategy | 240 |
| 15.2 | Proof of Main Theorem | 245 |
| 16 | Defense of the ZFC Axioms | 249 |
| 16.1 | Bounded Quantification | 250 |
| 16.1.1 | Foundation | 251 |
| 16.1.2 | Extensionality | 252 |
| 16.1.3 | Union | 252 |
| 16.2 | Comprehension | 253 |
| 16.3 | Moving to an Extension | 254 |
| 16.3.1 | Pairing | 254 |
| 16.3.2 | Powerset | 255 |
| 16.3.3 | Choice | 256 |
| 16.4 | Amalgamation Axioms | 257 |
| 16.4.1 | Infinity | 258 |
| 16.4.2 | Replacement | 260 |
| IV | | 263 |
| 17 | Platonism or Nominalism | 265 |
| 17.1 | Agenda-Setting | 265 |
| 17.2 | Ontologically Anti-Realist Options | 267 |
| 17.2.1 | Set Theoretic Reduction | 268 |
| 17.2.2 | Modal If-Thenism | 269 |

| | | |
|-----------|--|------------|
| 17.3 | Ontologically Realist Options | 272 |
| 18 | Indispensability | 273 |
| 18.1 | Introduction | 273 |
| 18.2 | The Classic Indispensability Worry | 274 |
| 18.2.1 | General Structure of Indispensability worries | 276 |
| 18.3 | Clarifying The Classic Worry | 277 |
| 18.4 | Motivation Via Specific Problem Cases | 279 |
| 18.5 | Adequate Paraphrase | 282 |
| 19 | A Conditional Nominalistic Paraphrase Strategy | 287 |
| 19.1 | Overview | 289 |
| 19.2 | Definitions | 291 |
| 19.3 | The Translation | 295 |
| 19.4 | Justifying Truth Condition Adequacy | 296 |
| 19.4.1 | Formal Justification for Truth Conditions Adequacy | 297 |
| 19.5 | Inferential Role Adequacy | 299 |
| 20 | Explanatory Indispensability | 303 |
| 20.1 | Introduction | 303 |
| 20.2 | Magicadas | 304 |
| 20.2.1 | An Argument for Explanatory Indispensability | 304 |
| 20.3 | Nominalizing Baker's Explanation | 307 |
| 20.3.1 | Nominalizing the Conditional | 307 |
| 20.3.2 | Asserting this as a Law | 314 |
| 20.4 | Explanatory Power | 315 |
| 21 | Physical Magnitude Statements and Sparsity | 319 |
| 21.1 | Putnam's Counting Argument | 321 |
| 21.1.1 | The argument | 321 |
| 21.1.2 | Clarifying the Argument | 325 |
| 21.1.3 | Responding to the Counting Argument | 330 |
| 21.2 | The Sparse Magnitudes Problem | 331 |
| 21.3 | Answering the Weak Literal Statement Challenge | 334 |
| 21.4 | Answering the Strong Literal Statement Challenge | 336 |
| 21.5 | Rejecting the Adequacy of the Simple Analysis | 338 |
| 21.6 | Appeal to Objects in Other Possible Worlds | 340 |
| 21.7 | Physical Quantity Abstracta | 341 |
| 21.8 | Summary Overview | 343 |
| 21.9 | Final notes | 345 |

| | | |
|-----------|---|------------|
| 22 | Grounding Indispensability and Nominalism | 347 |
| 22.1 | Some Constraints on Paraphrase Irrelevant to Grounding . . . | 349 |
| 22.2 | Grounding the non-fundamental facts invoked above | 353 |
| 23 | Quantifier Variance | 357 |
| 23.1 | Mathematician’s Freedom and QVEMF | 359 |
| 23.2 | Grounding Indispensability Worries for QV | 365 |
| 23.3 | Rejecting Grounding | 367 |
| 23.4 | Agnostic Platonism | 369 |
| 23.5 | Analogy with Holes | 373 |
| 24 | Logicism and Structuralism | 377 |
| 24.1 | Logicism | 377 |
| 24.1.1 | Arguably a kind of logicism | 377 |
| 24.1.2 | Securing some traditional benefits of logicism | 380 |
| 24.2 | Structuralism | 382 |
| 24.2.1 | Advantages over Ante-Rem Structuralism | 384 |
| 25 | Conclusion | 389 |
| 25.1 | Summary | 389 |
| 25.2 | Truth-value realism | 391 |
| 25.3 | The access problem | 392 |
| A | Auxiliary Definitions from Chapter 7 | 395 |
| B | Set Theoretic Mimicry | 399 |
| C | Natural Deduction System | 401 |
| C.1 | Correctness For Natural Deduction | 403 |
| D | Useful Corollaries to Axioms | 407 |
| D.1 | More Basic Box Lemmas | 407 |
| D.2 | Box and Diamond Simplification Lemmas | 410 |
| D.3 | Multiple Definitions Lemmas | 413 |
| D.4 | Singleton Lemma | 415 |
| E | Isomorphism Theorem | 417 |
| F | PA_{\diamond} and Infinite Well Ordering Lemmas | 429 |
| F.1 | Constructing the well-ordering | 431 |
| F.2 | Verification | 434 |

| | | |
|----------|---|------------|
| F.3 | Possibly PA_\diamond | 445 |
| G | Properties of Initial Segments | 449 |
| G.1 | Isomorphism Agreement Lemmas | 449 |
| G.2 | V Comparability Lemma | 453 |
| G.3 | Proper Extension Lemma | 458 |
| G.4 | Hierarchy Extending Lemma | 461 |
| G.5 | Hierarchy-Combining | 466 |
| G.6 | Fleshing Out | 473 |
| H | Translation Lemmas | 479 |
| H.1 | Assignment Tweaking Lemma | 479 |
| H.2 | Translation Theorem | 482 |
| H.3 | Bounded Quantifiers Lemma | 490 |
| H.4 | Translation Simplification Lemmas | 493 |
| I | Detailed Justification of ZFC Axioms | 499 |
| I.1 | Translation Equivalence Lemma | 499 |
| I.2 | Foundation | 500 |
| I.3 | Extensionality | 502 |
| I.4 | Union | 503 |
| I.5 | Comprehension | 506 |
| I.6 | Pairing | 516 |
| I.7 | Powerset | 518 |
| I.8 | Choice | 523 |
| I.9 | Potentialist Infinity | 527 |
| I.10 | Replacement | 532 |
| I.10.1 | Constructing V_{n+2} and ρ_{n+2} | 539 |
| I.10.2 | Verification for \vec{V}_{n+2} | 544 |
| I.10.3 | Constructing \vec{V}_{n+4} | 546 |